

American Homicide Supplemental Volume (AHSV)

Criminal Justice (CJ)

Randolph Roth

October, 2009

A supplement to Randolph Roth, *American Homicide*
(The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2009)



The following tables were created to assess the impact of deterrence on adult homicide rates. Did changes in the likelihood or severity of punishment correlate with changes in the adult homicide rate? The data suggest not. The homicide rate rose dramatically, for instance, in Georgia after 1863 and in New Hampshire and Vermont after 1846, but clearance and conviction rates did not change. Places with historically low homicide rates, like New Hampshire and Vermont, had higher rates of clearance and conviction than states with historically high homicide rates, like Georgia. But those differences should not be overstated. Even in Vermont and New Hampshire, fewer than half of all homicides in the nineteenth century led to a conviction.

The historic tables are based on the number of known homicides or homicide indictments in jurisdictions with complete or near complete court records. To compare historic conviction rates with today's rates, it is necessary to adjust the historic tables for

the proportion of homicides that did not leave a trace in the surviving records. The proportion of unknown cases is small in New Hampshire and Vermont, and in Holmes and Ross counties in Ohio—less than 5 percent. The proportion of unknown cases is large, however, in Georgia, for which an estimated 20 percent of all nineteenth-century homicides do not appear in the surviving records.

The tables for Virginia have not yet been compiled, because the records of the General Court have not survived from the colonial or revolutionary period, and because cases that appear in the county records after 1785 have not yet been traced through district court records, where felony cases were decided. The tables for Cuyahoga County, Ohio, have also not been created, because the data were gathered from inquests and newspapers. Systematic research in the county's court records has not yet begun.

Table of Contents

The United States

Murders and Manslaughters Cleared by Arrest, 2002-6

Georgia

Judicial Outcomes for Suspects in Known Homicides of Adults in Georgia, 1790-1900: Counts

Judicial Outcomes for Suspects in Known Homicides of Adults in Georgia, 1790-1900: Percentages

Judicial Outcomes of Homicide Trials in Georgia, 1790-1900: Percentages

Sentences of Persons Found Guilty of Homicide in Georgia, 1790-1900: Counts

Sentences of Persons Found Guilty of Homicide in Georgia, 1790-1900: Percentages

New Hampshire and Vermont

Judicial Outcomes for Suspects in Known Homicides of Adults in New Hampshire and Vermont, 1790-1900: Counts

Judicial Outcomes for Suspects in Known Homicides of Adults in New Hampshire and Vermont, 1790-1900: Percentages

Judicial Outcomes of Homicide Trials in New Hampshire and Vermont, 1790-1900: Counts

Judicial Outcomes of Homicide Trials in New Hampshire and Vermont, 1790-1900: Percentages

Sentences of Persons Found Guilty of Homicide in New Hampshire and Vermont, 1790-1900

Illinois

Judicial Outcomes for Suspects in Known Homicides of Adults in Illinois, 1812-1900: Counts

Judicial Outcomes for Suspects in Known Homicides of Adults in Illinois, 1812-1900: Percentages

Judicial Outcomes of Homicide Trials in Illinois, 1812-1900: Counts

Judicial Outcomes of Homicide Trials in Illinois, 1812-1900: Percentages

Sentences of Persons Found Guilty of Homicide in Illinois, 1812-1900

Nebraska

Judicial Outcomes for Indicted Homicide Suspects in Douglas County, Nebraska, 1880-1920

Ohio

Judicial Outcomes for Suspects in Known Homicides of Adults in Holmes and Ross Counties, Ohio, 1798-1900: Counts

Judicial Outcomes for Suspects in Known Homicides of Adults in Holmes and Ross Counties, Ohio, 1798-1900: Percentages

Judicial Outcomes of Homicide Trials in Holmes and Ross Counties, Ohio, 1798-1900: Counts

Judicial Outcomes of Homicide Trials in Holmes and Ross Counties, Ohio, 1798-1900: Percentages

Sentences of Persons Found Guilty of Homicide in Holmes and Ross Counties, Ohio, 1798-1900

Philadelphia

Judicial Outcomes for Indicted Suspects Tried for Interracial Homicides in Philadelphia, 1860-1901

Judicial Outcomes for Indicted Suspects Tried for Homicides in Philadelphia, 1839-1901

The United States

Murders and Manslaughters Cleared by Arrest in the United States, 2002-6

	Number of Murders and Manslaughters	Percentage Cleared by Arrest
The United States	69974	0.62
Cities	53770	0.61
Suburbs	11883	0.63
Rural communities	4321	0.76

Source: Bureau of Justice Statistics (2002-6) Sourcebook of Criminal Justice Statistics Online, Table 4.19 (<http://www.albany.edu/sourcebook/index.html>).

Georgia

**Judicial Outcomes for Suspects in Known Homicides of Adults
in Georgia, 1790-1900: Counts**

	Blacks	Whites	Indians	Unknown	Total
1790-1863					
Guilty	8	23	0	0	31
Not Guilty	2	23	0	0	25
Insane	0	0	0	0	0
Dropped	1	9	0	0	10
Not Indicted	1	25	0	0	26
Killed	0	1	0	0	1
Escaped	1	23	6	1	31
	13	104	6	1	124
1864-1900					
Guilty	34	34	0	4	72
Not Guilty	5	33	0	2	40
Insane	0	2	0	0	2
Dropped	3	39	0	6	48
Not Indicted	16	29	0	2	47
Killed	1	5	0	0	6
Escaped	11	20	0	8	39
	70	162	0	22	254

Note: Each homicide case is counted once, even if it involved multiple victims or multiple assailants. The data reflect the outcomes for the principal assailants in each case. The data are from Franklin, Gilmer, Jasper, Rabun, and Wilkes counties, supplemented by data on slave trials from Elbert and Putnam counties. No suspect in a homicide case in Georgia died from suicide or natural causes. All who died were themselves victims of homicide.

**Judicial Outcomes for Suspects in Known Homicides of Adults
in Georgia, 1790-1900: Percentages**

	Blacks	Whites	Indians	Unknown	Total
1790-1863					
Guilty	.62	.22	0	0	.25
Not Guilty	.15	.22	0	0	.20
Insane	0	0	0	0	0
Dropped	.08	.09	0	0	.08
Not Indicted	.08	.24	0	0	.21
Killed	0	.01	0	0	.01
Escaped	.08	.22	1.00	1.00	.25
	13	104	6	1	124
1864-1900					
Guilty	.49	.21	-	.18	.28
Not Guilty	.07	.20	-	.09	.16
Insane	0	.01	-	0	.01
Dropped	.04	.24	-	.27	.19
Not Indicted	.23	.18	-	.09	.19
Killed	.01	.03	-	.00	.02
Escaped	.16	.12	-	.36	.15
	70	162	0	22	254

Note: Each homicide case is counted once, even if it involved multiple victims or multiple assailants. The data reflect the outcomes for the principal assailants in each case. The data are from Franklin, Gilmer, Jasper, Rabun, and Wilkes counties, supplemented by data on slave trials from Elbert and Putnam counties. No suspect in a homicide case in Georgia died from suicide or natural causes. All who died were themselves victims of homicide.

**Judicial Outcomes of Homicide Trials in Georgia, 1790-1900:
Percentages**

	Blacks	Whites	Unknown
1790-1863			
Found guilty of murder	.70	.20	-
Found guilty of manslaughter	.10	.22	-
Plead guilty to murder	0	0	-
Plead guilty to manslaughter	0	.09	-
Found not guilty	.20	.50	-
Found not guilty by reason of insanity	0	0	-
	10	46	0
1864-1900			
Found guilty of murder	.49	.16	0
Found guilty of manslaughter	.26	.26	.67
Plead guilty to murder	.05	.03	0
Plead guilty to manslaughter	.08	.01	0
Found not guilty	.13	.51	.33
Found not guilty by reason of insanity	0	.03	0
	39	69	6

**Sentences of Persons Found Guilty of Homicide in Georgia, 1790-1900:
Counts**

	Blacks	Whites	Unknown
1790-1863			
One to Nine Years	0	6	0
Ten to Twenty Years	0	0	0
Twenty-One to Fifty Years	0	0	0
Life in Prison	0	1	0
Death	7	8	0
	13	104	1
1864-1900			
One to Nine Years	5	8	3
Ten to Twenty Years	8	5	0
Twenty-One to Fifty Years	0	0	0
Life in Prison	12	8	0
Death	8	5	0
	70	162	22

**Sentences of Persons Found Guilty of Homicide in Georgia, 1790-1900:
Percentages**

	Blacks	Whites	Unknown
1790-1863			
One to Nine Years	0	.06	0
Ten to Twenty Years	0	0	0
Twenty-One to Fifty Years	0	0	0
Life in Prison	0	.01	0
Death	.54	.08	0
	13	104	1
1864-1900			
One to Nine Years	.07	.05	.14
Ten to Twenty Years	.11	.03	0
Twenty-One to Fifty Years	0	0	0
Life in Prison	.17	.05	0
Death	.11	.03	0
	70	162	22

Note: Not all death sentences were carried out. Some condemned persons received pardons or commutations.

New Hampshire and Vermont

**Judicial Outcomes for Suspects in Known Homicides of Adults
in New Hampshire and Vermont, 1790-1900: Counts**

	Blacks	Whites	Indians	Unknown	Total
Guilty	5	218	1	0	224
Not Guilty	0	80	2	0	82
Insane	0	27	0	0	27
Dropped	0	29	0	0	29
Not Indicted	0	136	0	0	136
Died	0	6	0	0	6
Suicide	1	25	0	0	26
Escaped	0	48	0	36	84
	6	569	3	36	614

Note: Each homicide case is counted once, even if it involved multiple victims or multiple assailants. The data reflect the outcomes for the principal assailants in each case. No suspect in a homicide case in New Hampshire or Vermont was killed. All who died were victims of suicide or natural causes.

**Judicial Outcomes for Suspects in Known Homicides of Adults
in New Hampshire and Vermont, 1790-1900: Percentages**

	Blacks	Whites	Indians	Unknown	Total
Guilty	.83	.38	.33	0	.36
Not Guilty	0	.14	.67	0	.13
Insane	0	.05	0	0	.04
Dropped	0	.05	0	0	.05
Not Indicted	0	.24	0	0	.22
Died	0	.01	0	0	.01
Suicide	.17	.04	0	0	.04
Escaped	0	.08	0	1.00	.14
	6	569	3	36	614

Note: Each homicide case is counted once, even if it involved multiple victims or multiple assailants. The data reflect the outcomes for the principal assailants in each case. No suspect in a homicide case in New Hampshire or Vermont was killed. All who died were victims of suicide or natural causes.

**Judicial Outcomes of Homicide Trials
in New Hampshire and Vermont, 1790-1900: Counts**

	Blacks	Whites	Indians
Found guilty of murder	3	73	1
Found guilty of manslaughter	1	61	0
Found guilty of assault	0	4	0
Plead guilty to murder	1	35	0
Plead guilty to manslaughter	0	40	0
Plead guilty to assault	0	5	0
Found not guilty	0	80	2
Found not guilty by reason of insanity	0	11	0
	5	309	3

Note: The data do not include cases in which the accused were not indicted by reason of insanity. Only cases which were plead or decided by a jury are included. Hung juries are included with not guilty verdicts. Assault charges include assault and battery, aggravated assault, and assault with intent to commit murder.

**Judicial Outcomes of Homicide Trials
in New Hampshire and Vermont, 1790-1900: Percentages**

	Blacks	Whites	Indians
Found guilty of murder	.60	.24	.33
Found guilty of manslaughter	.20	.20	0
Found guilty of assault	0	.01	0
Plead guilty to murder	.20	.11	0
Plead guilty to manslaughter	0	.13	0
Plead guilty to assault	0	.02	0
Found not guilty	0	.26	.67
Found not guilty by reason of insanity	0	.04	0
	5	309	3

Note: The data do not include cases in which the accused were not indicted by reason of insanity. Only cases which were plead or decided by a jury are included. Hung juries are included with not guilty verdicts. Assault charges include assault and battery, aggravated assault, and assault with intent to commit murder.

**Sentences of Persons Found Guilty of Homicide
in New Hampshire and Vermont, 1790-1900**

	Blacks	Whites	Indians	Unknown
One to Nine Years	0	52	0	0
Ten to Twenty Years	1	50	0	0
Twenty-One to Fifty Years	0	22	0	0
Life in Prison	2	25	0	0
Death	2	50	1	0
	6	569	3	36

	Blacks	Whites	Indians	Unknown
One to Nine Years	0	.09	0	0
Ten to Twenty Years	.17	.09	0	0
Twenty-One to Fifty Years	0	.04	0	0
Life in Prison	.33	.04	0	0
Death	.33	.09	.33	0
	6	569	3	36

Note: Not all death sentences were carried out. Some condemned persons received pardons or commutations.

Illinois

**Judicial Outcomes for Suspects in Known Homicides of Adults
in Illinois, 1812-1900: Counts**

	Blacks	Whites	Indians	Unknown
Guilty	0	30	0	0
Not Guilty	1	33	0	0
Insane	0	1	0	0
Dropped	0	7	0	0
Not Indicted	0	11	0	0
Killed	0	0	0	0
Suicide	0	0	0	0
Escaped	0	24	2	1
	1	106	2	1

Note: Each homicide case is counted once, even if it involved multiple victims or multiple assailants. The data reflect the outcomes for the principal assailants in each case. The data are from Calhoun, Henderson, and Williamson counties.

**Judicial Outcomes for Suspects in Known Homicides of Adults
in Illinois, 1812-1900: Percentages**

	Blacks	Whites	Indians	Unknown
Guilty	0	.28	0	0
Not Guilty	1.00	.31	0	0
Insane	0	.01	0	0
Dropped	0	.07	0	0
Not Indicted	0	.10	0	0
Killed	0	0	0	0
Suicide	0	0	0	0
Escaped	0	.23	1.00	1.00
	1	106	2	1

Note: Each homicide case is counted once, even if it involved multiple victims or multiple assailants. The data reflect the outcomes for the principal assailants in each case. The data are from Calhoun, Henderson, and Williamson counties.

**Judicial Outcomes of Homicide Trials
in Illinois, 1812-1900: Counts**

	Blacks	Whites	Indians
Found guilty of murder	0	15	0
Found guilty of manslaughter	0	14	0
Found guilty of assault	0	0	0
Plead guilty to murder	0	1	0
Plead guilty to manslaughter	0	0	0
Plead guilty to assault	0	0	0
Found not guilty	1	33	0
Found not guilty by reason of insanity	0	1	0
	1	64	0

Note: The data do not include cases in which the accused were not indicted by reason of insanity. Only cases which were plead or decided by a jury are included. Hung juries are included with not guilty verdicts. Assault charges include assault and battery, aggravated assault, and assault with intent to commit murder.

**Judicial Outcomes of Homicide Trials
in Illinois, 1812-1900: Percentages**

	Blacks	Whites	Indians
Found guilty of murder	0	.23	0
Found guilty of manslaughter	0	.22	0
Found guilty of assault	0	0	0
Plead guilty to murder	0	.02	0
Plead guilty to manslaughter	0	0	0
Plead guilty to assault	0	0	0
Found not guilty	1.00	.52	0
Found not guilty by reason of insanity	0	.02	0
	1	64	0

Note: The data do not include cases in which the accused were not indicted by reason of insanity. Only cases which were plead or decided by a jury are included. Hung juries are included with not guilty verdicts. Assault charges include assault and battery, aggravated assault, and assault with intent to commit murder.

**Sentences of Persons Found Guilty of Homicide
in Illinois, 1812-1900**

	Blacks	Whites	Indians	Unknown
One to Nine Years	0	11	0	0
Ten to Twenty Years	0	7	0	0
Twenty-One to Fifty Years	0	4	0	0
Life in Prison	0	2	0	0
Death	0	3	0	0
	1	106	2	1

	Blacks	Whites	Indians	Unknown
One to Nine Years	0	.10	0	0
Ten to Twenty Years	0	.07	0	0
Twenty-One to Fifty Years	0	.04	0	0
Life in Prison	0	.02	0	0
Death	0	.03	0	0
	1	106	2	1

Note: Not all death sentences were carried out. Some condemned persons received pardons or commutations.

Nebraska

**Judicial Outcomes for Indicted Homicide Suspects
in Douglas County, Nebraska, 1880-1920**

	% Pled Guilty	% Found Guilty or Insane	% Found Not Guilty / Dismissed / No Verdict	N
Black Suspects				
Black Victims	.31	.49	.21	39
White Victims	.36	.54	.11	28
White Suspects				
Black Victims	.00	.00	1.00	7
White Victims	.06	.32	.62	206

Ohio

Outcomes of Homicides Cases in Holmes and Ross Counties, Ohio, 1798-1900

	Blacks	Whites	Indians	Total
Found Guilty	4	25	0	29
Pled Guilty	2	3	0	5
Not Guilty	1	19	0	20
Insane	1	3	0	4
Dropped	0	2	0	2
Not Indicted	3	31	0	34
Killed	0	0	1	1
Suicide	0	0	0	0
Escaped	1	12	2	15
	12	95	3	110

Note: Each homicide case is counted once, even if it involved multiple victims or multiple assailants. The data reflect the outcomes for the principal assailants in each case. All cases involving the homicide of an adult are included. One homicide suspect was killed. No suspect in a homicide case in Ohio was a victim of suicide or natural causes.

Outcomes of Homicides Cases in Holmes and Ross Counties, Ohio, 1798-1900

	Blacks	Whites	Indians	Total
Found Guilty	.33	.26	0	.26
Pled Guilty	.17	.03	0	.05
Not Guilty	.08	.20	0	.18
Insane	.08	.03	0	.04
Dropped	0	.02	0	.02
Not Indicted	.25	.33	0	.31
Killed	0	0	.33	.01
Suicide	0	0	0	0
Escaped	.08	.13	.67	.14
	12	95	3	110

Note: Each homicide case is counted once, even if it involved multiple victims or multiple assailants. The data reflect the outcomes for the principal assailants in each case. All cases involving the homicide of an adult are included. One homicide suspect was killed. No suspect in a homicide case in Ohio was a victim of suicide or natural causes.

**Outcomes of Trials in Homicide Cases
in Holmes and Ross Counties, Ohio, 1798-1900**

	Blacks	Whites	Indians
Found guilty of murder	0	11	0
Found guilty of manslaughter	4	13	0
Found guilty of assault	0	1	0
Plead guilty to murder	0	1	0
Plead guilty to manslaughter	2	2	0
Plead guilty to assault	0	0	0
Found not guilty	1	19	0
Found not guilty by reason of insanity	1	2	0
	8	49	0

Note: Does not include cases in which the accused were not indicted by reason of insanity. Only cases which were plead or decided by a jury are included. Hung juries are included with not guilty verdicts. Assault charges include assault and battery, aggravated assault, and assault with intent to commit murder.

**Outcomes of Trials in Homicide Cases
in Holmes and Ross Counties, Ohio, 1798-1900**

	Blacks	Whites	Indians
Found guilty of murder	0	.22	-
Found guilty of manslaughter	.50	.27	-
Found guilty of assault	0	.02	-
Plead guilty to murder	0	.02	-
Plead guilty to manslaughter	.25	.04	-
Plead guilty to assault	0	0	-
Found not guilty	.13	.39	-
Found not guilty by reason of insanity	.13	.04	-
	8	49	0

Note: Does not include cases in which the accused were not indicted by reason of insanity. Only cases which were plead or decided by a jury are included. Hung juries are included with not guilty verdicts. Assault charges include assault and battery, aggravated assault, and assault with intent to commit murder.

**Sentences in Known Homicide Cases
in Holmes and Ross Counties, Ohio, 1798-1880**

	Blacks	Whites	Indians
Fine	0	1	0
One to Nine Years	4	10	0
Ten to Twenty Years	0	3	0
Twenty-One to Fifty Years	1	1	0
Asylum	1	3	0
Branded	1	1	0
Life in Prison	0	7	0
Death	0	3	0
	12	95	3

	Blacks	Whites	Indians
Fine	0	.01	0
One to Nine Years	.33	.11	0
Ten to Twenty Years	0	.03	0
Twenty-One to Fifty Years	.08	.01	0
Asylum	.08	.03	0
Branded	.08	.01	0
Life in Prison	0	.07	0
Death	0	.03	0
	12	95	3

Note: Not all death sentences were carried out. Some condemned persons received pardons or commutations.

Philadelphia

**Judicial Outcomes for Indicted Suspects Tried for Interracial Homicides
in Philadelphia, 1860-1901 (by victim)**

	% Found Guilty	Number of Trials
Black Suspects in Homicides of Whites	.38	45
White Suspects in Homicides of Blacks	.26	42

**Judicial Outcomes for Indicted Suspects Tried for Homicides
in Philadelphia, 1839-1901 (by victim)**

	Plead guilty	Found guilty	Total	% Guilty
Race of suspect				
Black	24	56	131	.61
Chinese	0	1	1	1.00
Hispanic	0	0	1	.00
White	114	299	823	.50
Unknown	3	15	155	.11
Total	141	371	1111	.46

NOTE: The difficulty thus far of identifying the race of 155 suspects may create a false perception of the likelihood of conviction by race, since few such persons pled guilty or were found guilty. Many of their cases were dropped, which makes it difficult to find additional information on the suspects in the newspaper.

